

# **Meeting: LLC Board**

Date: October 14, 2021

## **Attendees**

### **LLC Board:**

Maja Andjelkovic  
Lars Eggert  
Jason Livingood  
Sean Turner  
Peter Van Roste

### **Staff/Secretariat:**

Jay Daley  
Laura Nugent  
Lee-Berkeley Shaw  
Greg Wood

### **Observers/Guests:**

Michelle Cotton  
Sean Croghan  
Sandy Ginoza  
Len Hause

### **Scribe:**

Liz Flynn

### **Conflicts of Interest Declared:**

**None.**

---

## Part I: Open to the Public

### 1. Record e-vote results

One e-vote has been completed since the previous Board meeting.

a. The September board meeting minutes were approved with the board e-voting as follows:

Maja Andjelkovic: YES

Lars Eggert: YES

Jason Livingood: YES

Sean Turner: YES

Peter Van Roste: YES

### 2. Financial statements

The August financial statement is almost ready for board review and will soon be approved via e-vote.

### 3. Update on IETF technical work

Emails have gone out from the IESG regarding 360-degree reviews of IESG Area Directors, which is happening for the first time. Lars will send emails to all the leadership explaining the process. Lars also reported that discussion about creating a new "important-news" mailing list has been ongoing. The IESG will announce something shortly. Otherwise, technical work is gearing up for IETF 112 and everything is going well.

### 4. Next steps on IASA2 retrospective report

Jason is finalizing the last small issues on the IASA2 retrospective report and will have a final document ready for board approval soon, which will then occur via e-vote. After this is approved by the board, a short presentation will be created to share with the community at IETF 112.

## 5. Executive Director report - Public

---

# Public Executive Director Report

For the IETF Administration LLC Board meeting on 14 October 2021

This report is provided by the IETF Executive Director and is taken as read at the meeting allowing more time for questions or follow ups. This report is public and confidential matters are in a separate report.

## 1. Strategic Matters

Nothing to report.

## 2. Policies

### Antitrust

The first draft of proposed antitrust guidelines has been [published](#) and I am listed as one of the co-authors along with the main author, Joel Halpern, and our external counsel Brad Biddle. This I-D has been taken to gendispatch to see if it has legs and it is likely it will be picked up and dispatched for further discussion. In the meantime, the authors have been provided with draft guidelines written in 2007 by external counsel for the then Chair. These 2007 guidelines, together with the feedback received after initial publication, are being incorporated into a second version.

As a reminder, the principle behind the draft is not to set policy but to clarify and explain existing policy and the law as it applies to the IETF, without providing legal advice.

## 3. Finance

### Budget

An initial draft of the 2022 budget is presented as a separate paper.

## 4. RFPs and contracts

### Brand values RFP

This RFP has closed and we are assessing the bids received.

## 5. Meetings

### IETF 113

As previously reported the anticipated dates for determining IETF 113:

- 20 - 30 September 2021 Collect missing proposal information and negotiate with venues
- 1 October 2021 Provide IETF Executive Director with recommended city(ies) for site inspection trip
- 2 - 15 October 2021 Organize site inspection and negotiate with selected venues
- 16 - 22 October 2021 Site inspection of 1 or 2 selected cities
- 29 October 2021 Site Report, with recommendation, provided to Jay for review
- 1 November 2021 Instructions from IETF as to which venue to contract for IETF113
- 17 December 2021 Contract completed with selected venue

## 6. Tools/RPC/RSOC/RSE

### RFC Editor Future Program

This program appears to be nearing completion with a detailed [I-D](#) proposing a v3 of the RFC Editor model. A quick synopsis of the new model is:

- A new document stream for the RFC Series
- The RSE role goes and is replaced by an RFC Series Consulting Editor (RSCE) with the same skill set but no role in managing the RPC.
- A new RFC Series Working Group (RSWG) operating similarly to an IETF working group, where policy is agreed for the new series in the form of consensus I-Ds.
- A new RFC Series Approval Board (RSAB) made up of a representative of each stream and the RSCE that approves I-Ds produced by the RSWG to become RFCs.

The IETF LLC will be responsible for the appointment and contract management of the RSCE and with that in mind I have already spoken to our recruitment firm with a view to recruitment in the first quarter of next year. This recruitment will include a panel of community members who advise on the process and candidates.

### rfc-editor.org web site upgrade

The rfc-editor.org website was recently upgraded to current software after last being upgraded in 2017. The long delay is because the work required to deliver v3 of RFC XML was prioritised over other RFC Editor technical work by the then RSE.

### Content management

Work continues to streamline, simplify and improve the quality of our web content, including:

- The Internet Standards section of the website has now been revamped and the participation section is due next.
- Development of a proposed authors.ietf.org single stop shop for I-D authors.
- Integration between our chosen wiki product and Datatracker is now in testing.

- Following the upgrade of the rfc-editor.org site, discussions on updating the content on that site can now restart. It is likely that no major changes will be agreed until the implementation of the v3 model for the RFC Editor.

## Datatracker performance

Significant work is underway to address performance issues with Datatracker, including:

- The underlying MariaDB has now been instrumented with the standard user stats <https://mariadb.com/kb/en/user-statistics/>
- The slow query log is activate and collecting all queries over 5 seconds. Analysis of this is pointing to a handful of large MyISAM tables as possible causes of slow performance
- A new performance monitoring system, [ScoutAPM](#) has been implemented for Datatracker. This integrates deeply into Python/Django and analyses performance back to the underlying SQL.
- The Tools Team PM is planning a performance focused codesprint with the data collected above supplied to participants.
- By the time of the board meeting, an RFP will have been issued for specialist DBS services to assist with two database migrations that will improve performance.

## Moving off tools.ietf.org

Work continues as follows:

- The pages for published I-Ds and RFCs are temporarily being redirected to Datatracker.
- Key online tools for authors have been reimplemented by our new in-house developer and are soon to enter beta testing.
- The outsourced project to migrate the source code for Datatracker, Mailarchive and some other tools is nearing completion.
- The outsourced project to develop a new BibXML service for XML references in I-Ds is well underway.
- The replacement static content is on the proposed authors.ietf.org site.
- The agenda tool functionality is being replicated in Datatracker.

This leaves a few outstanding items, including a few remaining online tools and permanent redirections.

Lars suggested that Jay send an email update to the working group chairs as well as the general community that explains why we are moving to new technical platforms and shares details. This is expected to be obvious for most

people given the slow performance of some of these tools, broken features, demand from the community for different technical capabilities, etc.

## **Security reviews**

We have signed a contract for an in-depth security review of Datatracker and work is expected to commence in November.

## **7. IESG/IAB/IRTF/Trust**

### **AD 360 Survey**

We have been supporting the IESG in their experimental 360 survey of ADs and will be operating the survey and collating results for them.

## **8. Communications/Outreach/Engagement**

### **WG Chairs training**

By the time of the board meeting, sessions for three of the four topics covered by the training program will have been completed. As of 7 October, 52 participants had registered for the training with 31 individuals attending. The training sessions so far have received a good average +45 Net Promoter Score, based on a survey of participants immediately after each session.

## **9. Miscellaneous**

### **Future of legal-consult list**

As I understand it, the IAOC did not have a permanent counsel and so relied on a combination of contracts for individual pieces of work and a list with community members with some legal knowledge, the legal-consult list. This list was inherited by the LLC and continues with much the same [membership](#) as before.

As we now have permanent counsel, this list is very rarely used and when it is there are very few replies. Accordingly I recommend that we thank the participants for their contributions and close the list.

---

## 6. 2022 Budget

Jay shared a high-level summary of the 2022 Budget and outlined key changes from the 2021 budget. The Board will review the full budget in more detail and an e-vote will be prepared soon for approval of this draft.

## 7. AOB

No questions or comments from observers.

# Part II: Board + Staff

## 1. Update on IETF 113 venue options

We are currently evaluating four potential venues for IETF 113 and coordinating a combination of virtual and in-person site visits. The specific cities were mentioned and Jay noted that the Secretariat will conduct site visits - either in-person or virtual as COVID travel restrictions permit - so that we can have a venue recommendation near the end of October. There remains considerable uncertainty over what travel restrictions may be in place in March 2022 as well as how many people may choose to attend in person, so the IETF LLC will need to assume greater risk and uncertainty than in the past but there really is no alternative - this is all down to the COVID environment and is out of our control.

## 2. Executive Director Report - Confidential

The Confidential Executive Director report discussed several legal and compliance issues.

One of the issues pertains to an ongoing campaign of apparent harassment against a member of the IETF community, in which the Ombusteam and others have attempted to resolve. As this has proven impossible, a recommendation will be made to the IETF LLC about actions which may be necessary in order to protect the safety and wellbeing of a member of the IETF community. Jay took the action item to prepare the text of the recommendation.

The Board then discussed how and what to make public in this case. It was tentatively agreed that the LLC would describe the specific actions taken at a high level and why, without sharing details of the individuals involved and in a manner to protect the identity of the IETF community member for their safety and wellbeing.



Another legal issue was explained that pertained to the rights granted to the IETF when an I-D is submitted and that once this has happened that the submitter no longer has rights to request removal. This is a long-standing IETF policy and has been checked once again with counsel. We are on firm ground and believe it is important to protect the strength of the Note Well and the IETF's rights over documents and publishing that we defend this. Jay was unsure if this will result in any litigation but the Board agreed this is why we have legal counsel and that we will defend the IETF's longstanding rights in this area.

### 3. AOB

Peter noted that CENTR produces a journalist's report after every IETF meeting, covering various topics of interest, and wondered why the IETF does not produce something similar. This has been discussed previously but due to the number of working groups and the context required to understand many of the documents discussed during IETF meetings, it is very difficult to produce anything that would be useful to a very wide audience.

## Part III: Board + ED Only

### 1. Discuss potential legal issue

### 2. Prep/sync for joint workshop

Lars described the goals of next week's IETF LLC-IESG-IAB-IRTF strategic planning workshop series as well as the specific objective for each of the 4 days. The Board and ED discussed remaining work to prepare for this and make it a productive series of workshops. In particular, issues to explore will be the structure, type, and cadence of future IETF meetings, how to improve diversity & inclusion, and more.

### 3. Goldman Sachs option decisions

Last meeting Goldman Sachs (GS), the LLC's investment advisors, proposed that we amend our recently adopted investment policy to increase our allocation in equities and in addition begin to use Private Equity (PE) investments. While there is the potential for higher returns with PE it must be balanced against higher fees and less liquidity. The Board discussed this briefly and agreed that we only recently adopted our investment policy based on GS guidance and it seems quite soon to make a major revision. At the same time, if our advisors recommend a change we should consider it and so agreed to set up a longer review and discussion in late November to early December 2021, as this issue is not urgent and the next several weeks are quite busy. The Board also asked Maja for advice on potential independent advisors that might

be able to facilitate this session, as it is likely an issue facing other non-profits. Maja agreed to work with Sean to identify some candidates and then Sean will schedule the discussion.

## Part IV: Board Only

The Board briefly discussed performance and reliability issues and concerns pertaining to our key technical platforms, such as the datatracker for which delays of tens of seconds on many requests appears quite normal. It was agreed that this is one of many indicators of technical debt at the IETF and potential technical investments will be addressed in the draft 2022 budget in a comprehensive fashion.